North Yorkshire Council

Community Development Services

Scarborough and Whitby Area Constituency Planning Committee 9 NOVEMBER 2023

23/00359/LB - FORMATION OF DRAINAGE ROUTES, INSTALLATION OF REPLACEMENT BENCHES, REPLACEMENT OF PLATFORM RAILINGS AND INSTALLATION OF REPLACEMENT PLATFORM SURFACE AT ST NICHOLAS SHELTERS FORESHORE ROAD SCARBOROUGH NORTH YORKSHIRE YO11 1PB ON BEHALF OF NORTH YORKSHIRE COUNCIL (JOE POISMANS) Report of the Assistant Director Planning – Community Development Services

1.0 PURPOSE OF THE REPORT

- 1.1 To determine a listed building consent for the formation of drainage routes, installation of replacement benches, replacement of platform railings and installation of replacement platform surface at st nicholas shelters, foreshore road, scarborough.
- 1.2 The proposal is being considered by members of the scarborough and whitby planning committee as the council is the applicant.

2.0 EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

RECOMMENDATION: That listed building consent be GRANTED subject to conditions.

2.1 This application seeks Listed Building consent for a series of repair and restoration works to the St Nicholas Shelters on Foreshore Road, Scarborough. The scheme would replace the existing platform railings and benches, whilst carrying out repair and drainage works to the platform and shelter. It is concluded that the works will preserve the special interest of the Listed Building and that Listed Building consent should be granted.



Ν

Reproduced by permission of Ordnance Survey on behalf of Her Majesty's Stationery Office. © Crown copyright and database right 2023 Ordnance Survey License number 100017946



3.0 Preliminary Matters

3.1 Access to the case file on Public Access can be found here

4.0 Site and Surroundings

- 4.1 The site comprises 2no. Edwardian tram shelters. The shelters were constructed between approximately 1904-1907, and are designated Grade II Listed structures. The shelters comprise cast-iron arcades to the front, and include supporting steel beams to the platforms above. The platforms include iron railings which are fixed around the platform edge.
- 4.2 The rear walls of the shelters comprise white and brown ceramic bricks with a 'glazed' external surface, whilst within the shelters are 3no. continuous stretches of modern benching which are fixed to the rear wall, and comprise timber seating.
- 4.3 The shelters are located on Foreshore Road between the Olympia Leisure and Coney Island amusement arcades. The shelters are separated from each other by the entrance to the St Nicholas Gardens to the west of the site. To the east of the site lies the South Bay of Scarborough, whilst to the west of the site lies the Town Hall. To the north-east of the site lies the Scarborough Harbour and main retail area of the Scarborough South Bay, including a number of amusement arcades food outlets, retail units and public houses.
- 4.4 The site also lies within the designated Conservation Area of Scarborough.

5.0 Description of Proposal

- 5.1 This application seeks Listed Building Consent for a series of restorative and repair works to the Grade II listed St Nicholas Shelters, Foreshore Road, Scarborough. The proposed works can be summarised as the following:
- Replacement of existing benches with 21no. benches
- Replacement of platform iron railings with steel railings
- Like-for-like replacement and repair of ceramic bricks
- Concrete slab repair and drainage works
- Pavement repair works
- General repair of metalwork, including spandrels, main frame and posts.

6.0 Planning Policy and Guidance

6.1 Section 16 (2) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires that, in considering whether to grant listed building consent for any works the local authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

Adopted Development Plan

The following policy documents assist in the assessment of the statutory test.

- 6.2 The Adopted Plan for this site is:
- Scarborough Borough Local Plan 2011 to 2032 adopted 2017

Emerging Development Plan - Material Consideration

6.3 There is no emerging development plan which covers the application site.

<u>Guidance - Material Considerations</u>

- National Planning Policy Framework 2021
- National Planning Practice Guidance
- National Design Guide

7.0 Consultation Responses

7.1 No consultation responses received.

Local Representations

7.2 One public comment has been received in support of the proposal. A summary of the comment can be viewed below, however to view full details please visit the web site.

Support

- In-keeping with the traditional architecture

8.0 Main Issues

- 8.1 In accordance with the aforementioned legal requirement, the sole consideration for the Committee in its determination of this application is:
- Whether or not the proposed works would preserve the special interest of the Listed Building

9.0 Assessment

Whether or not the proposed works would preserve the special interest of the Listed Building

9.1 The proposed works would comprise a number of repair and restoration works to the fabric of the Listed structure. These include repair works to the metalwork of

the shelters, including re-application of paint where applicable, and repair of concrete slabs, including infill mortar of damaged areas of the concrete. Drainage improvements would also be made to the concrete slab to help prevent water damage to the shelters.

- 9.2 There would be a total of 45no. replacement ceramic bricks to replace the damaged and missing bricks in the rear wall of the shelters. Retained bricks would also be repaired where necessary and steam-cleaned.
- 9.3 The proposal would replace the existing wall-mounted benches with individual steel-framed benches that would be fixed to the ground within each bay of the shelters, and would total 21no. benches. The benches would feature timber backs and seats.
- 9.4 The existing benches are relatively modern additions to the shelters, and therefore it is considered that their replacement with individual benches would not harm the special interest of the Listed shelters.
- 9.5 The proposal would also replace the existing railings atop the 'first floor' public viewing platform which are fixed to the shelters, and provide a safety barrier for occupants of the platform. The proposed replacement railings would be steel railings, and the central "ring" of the railing design would be very similar in terms of style and appearance to the existing railings.
- 9.6 The official Listing by Historic England, states of the benches and railings, 'these aforementioned features (benches and railings) are not of special architectural or historic interest'. It is therefore considered that the proposal to replace these elements of the shelters would not harm the special interest of the Grade II Listed structures, given the replacement features are contemporary additions.
- 9.7 Furthermore, it is considered that the main interest of the shelters are the cast-iron arcade frontages which provide the shelters with their form and structure, and these would remain in place with renovation and repair works occurring where applicable.

10.0 Planning Balance and Conclusion

- 10.1 Overall, the proposed works would comprise essential improvements and repair works to the shelters that would ensure safer, more comfortable shelters, and would include upgraded furnishings such as the proposed benches and railings that would allow greater appreciation of the special interest of the Listed Building by its users whilst successfully preserving the architectural integrity of the Grade II Listed structure, such that it will be sustained as a heritage asset for many years to come.
- 10.2 It is therefore considered that the proposal would preserve the special interest of the Listed shelters.

11.0 RECOMMENDATION

That permission be GRANTED subject to the conditions listed below:

1 Approved Plans

The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in strict accordance with the following plans:

- Railing Details
- Seat End Detail,
- North and South Shelter Plans (Drawing No. 21933-11 to 21933-24)

received on 24 February 2023, and;

- North Shelter Bench Plan (Drawing No. 21933-10 A)
- South Shelter Bench Plan (Drawing No. 21933-18 A)
- North Shelter Drainage and Slab Repair (Drawing No. 21933-13 A)
- North Shelter Repair Works (Drawing No. 21933-14 A)
- South Shelter Drainage and Slab Repair (Drawing No. 21933-21 A)
- South Shelter Repair Works (Drawing No. 21933-22 A)
- Proposed Repair Details Sheet 1 (Drawing No. 21933-25 A)
- Proposed Repair Details Sheet 2 (Drawing No. 21933-26 A)
- Design & Access Statement
- Heritage Statement

received on 22 August 2023, unless any amendment is first approved by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: for the avoidance of doubt.

2 All new works and works of making good shall be carried out in materials, and detailed, to match the adjoining original fabric except where shown otherwise on the approved drawings.

Reason: To preserve the architectural integrity of the Listed Building

3 No demolitions, stripping out, removal of structural elements, replacement of original joinery or fittings and finishes shall be carried out except where shown and noted on the approved drawings.

Reason: To preserve internal features of the Listed Building.

Target Determination Date: 17 October 2023

Case Officer: Mr Luke Hadfield

luke.hadfield@northyorks.gov.uk